CONTENTS

Abstract *i - iv*
Preface *v - vii*
List of Cases *viii - xxi*
List of Statutes, Rules and Regulations *xxii - xxiii*
List of Abbreviations *xxiv*
List of Tables *xxv*
List of Figures *xxvi*

Introduction *1 - 11*
CHAPTER – 1: SERVICES UNDER THE STATE: A PREVIEW 12-39
1.1. Overview 12
1.2. The Modern State: Its Meaning, Roles And Functions 13
1.3. The "Welfare Concept Of State" In India 15
1.4. Meaning and Scope of the 'State' under Article 12 of the Constitution of India 21
1.4.1. Other Authorities vis- a- vis Instrumentality or Agency of Government under Article 12 of the Constitution of India 22
1.5. Services Under the State 29
1.5.1. The State as a Performer of Public Function 30
1.6. A Sum Up 36

CHAPTER 2 - PROMOTION IN PUBLIC PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION IN INDIA: ITS RATIONAL, CONSTITUTIONALITY AND ROLE OF SENIORITY 40-98
2.1. Overview 40
2.2. The Structure of a Bureaucratic Organisation: A Weberian Concept 40
2.2.1. The Nature of Bureaucratic Hierarchy 43
2.3. Promotion- Meaning, Rationality and Constitutionality 44
2.3.1. Promotion - Its Meaning and Rationales 45
2.3.2. Promotion and Upgradation Distinguished 51
2.3.3. Promotion of Personnel in Services under the State: It's Constitutionality 57
a. Promotion in Services under the State: Article 16 and Its Relevance 60
b. Right to Promotion vs. Right to be Considered for Promotion 63
c. Reservation in Promotion with Consequential Seniority vis-a-vis Article 16 68
i. The Catch-up Rule and the Rule of Promotion with Consequential Seniority 71
ii. The Carry-Forward Rule 75
d. Right to be Considered for Promotion as guaranteed under Article 309 of the Constitution 84
e. Right to Be Considered for Promotion: How Made? 85
2.4. Promotion How Made vis-a-vis the Principle of Seniority 88
2.4.1. Importance of Seniority in Determining Promotion in Public Personnel Administration 88
2.4.2. Advantages of the Principle of Seniority 93
2.4.3. Performance Appraisal Report 94
2.5. A Sum-up 96

CHAPTER 3 - FIXATION OF SENIORITY FOR PROMOTION IN SERVICES UNDER THE STATE -AN ANALYSIS OF THE JUDICIAL OPINIONS 99-188
3.1. Overview 99
3.2. Seniority - Meaning, Concept and Constitutionality 99
3.3. Fixation of Seniority - The Underlying Principles 102
3.3.1. Primacy of Statutory Provisions 102
3.3.2. Absence of Rules: Executive Orders 106
3.3.3. Legality of the Statutes, Rules or Executive Order/Instructions Governing Seniority 17
3.4. General Principles Governing the Determination/Fixation of Seniority in Service 109
3.4.1. Length of Service 109
3.4.2. Meaning and Concept of Cadre and its Importance in Computing the Length of Service 119
3.4.3. Computation of Length of Service 123
a. From the Date of Appointment 124
b. From the Date of Continuous Officiation 130
c. From the Date of Probationary Appointment and Date of Examination 133
3.5. Seniority of Direct Recruits 134
3.6. Seniority of Promotees 135
a) When promotions are made irregularly 135
b) When promotion was passed over and given later 136
c) Seniority - when juniors and seniors are still officiating in higher cadre 136
d) Superseded officer cannot regain seniority 137
e) Seniority acquired by selection cannot be altered 137
f) Deemed date of promotion as basis for seniority 137
g) Retrospective promotion must not exceed number of vacancies 137
h) Denial of retrospective confirmation and seniority on retrospective promotion illegal 138
3.7. Inter Se Seniority 138
3.7.1. Inter se Seniority Between Reserved and General Category Candidates 138
a. Seniority of Roster Point Promotee 148
3.7.2. Inter se Seniority Between Candidates Holding Ad hoc Posts and Substantial Posts 151
3.7.3. Inter Se Seniority Between Direct Recruits and Direct Recruits 152
3.7.4. Inter Se Seniority Between Direct Recruits and Promotees 154
a. The Quota-Rota System 162
b. Consultation by the Central Government with the State Government while making Inter Se Seniority 170
3.8. Gradation List and Validity of Combined Seniority List 176
3.9. Delay and Latches in Claiming Seniority 182
3.10. A Sum Up 183

CHAPTER - 4 : PROMOTION OF PUBLIC PERSONNEL BY RULES OF SENIORITY IN VARIOUS SERVICES AND PUBLIC INSTITUTIONS: A BIRD'S EYE VIEW 189-269
4.1. Overview 189
4.2. The All India Services and Other Civil Services 191
4.2.1. The All-India Services Act, 1951 and Rules and Regulations Appurtenant to It 193
a. Regulation of Recruitment and Conditions of Service 195
b. Method of recruitment 195
c. Procedure for Selection and Appointment 203
d. Regulation of Cadres 205
e. Fixation of seniority 205
f. Inter-se Seniority 210
g. Gradation List 211
h. Inter-Cadre Transfer 211
4.2.2. The Civil Services of India 211
a. The Central Secretariat Service 212
b. Performance Appraisal 222
4.3. Judicial Service in India 224
4.3.1. All India Judicial Service 224
a. Appointment, posting and promotion of district judges 227
i. Appointing Authority 227
ii. Appointment by Promotion 228
iii. Consultation with the High Court 236
iv. Power of governor to Frame Rules 238
v. Control over Subordinate Courts 240
4.3.2. Seniority and Appointment of Judges of High Court and Supreme Court 241
4.4. The Defence Services 243
4.4.1. Promotion and Seniority in the Indian Army 244
4.4.2. Promotion and Seniority in the Indian Air Force 246
4.5. Promotion of University Teachers as Laid Down in the Career Advancement Scheme by the Universities Grants Commission 257
4.6. A Sum Up 266

CHAPTER - 5 : CAREER ADVANCEMENT IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN LEADING DEMOCRACIES AND ROLE OF THE CONCEPT OF SENIORITY 270-327
5.1. Overview 270
5.2. Structure in Public Administration in United States of America, Career Advancement and the Role of Seniority Norm 271
5.2.1. Types of Bureaucratic Organisations in the United States of America 272
a. Cabinet Departments 272
b. Independent Executive Agencies and Regulatory Agencies 273
c. Government Corporations 273
5.2.2. Political Patronage versus Merit 274
5.2.3. Legislation of Merit 276
a. Early Efforts to Adopt Merit: The Jenckes Bill 276
b. The Pendleton Act, 1883 276

c. Other Legislations 278
5.2.4. The Recruitment Process and the Role of Seniority in the Federal Civil Service System 279
a. Inside or Outside 280
b. Performance Appraisal System 280
c. Internal Promotions 282
d. Recruitment Procedure 282
e. Merit Principles 284
f. Career Advancement 285
g. Seniority or Merit - The Debate 286
h. Seniority and the Science of Shoveling 289
i. Seniority and the First-Class Worker 290
j. The Scientific Governance of Organisations 291
5.3. Public Administration in United Kingdom: Promotion and Seniority 293
5.3.1. The Civil Service Management Code 296
5.3.2. Promotion in the Civil Service of United Kingdom 301
5.3.3. Principles of Promotion 302
a. Appointment of North Cote-Trevelyan Committee 302
b. The Fulton Committee 303
5.3.4. Recognition of Seniority for Promotion in Recent Times in United Kingdom 303
5.4. Civil Service in France 308
5.5. Public Administration in Germany 311
5.6. Public Administration in South Africa 314
5.7. The People's Republic of China 315
5.8. Public Administration in Canada 319
5.9. Public Administration in Australia 321
5.10. Public Administration in Japan 322
5.11. A Sum-Up 324

CHAPTER - 6 : DETERMINATION OF SENIORITY FOR PROMOTION IN SERVICES UNDER THE STATE WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL - AN EMPIRICAL STUDY 328-366
6.1. Overview 328
6.2. The Bureaucratic Hierarchy in West Bengal 328
6.3. Promotion and Seniority Policy of the Government of West Bengal 330
6.3.1. The Modified Career Advancement Scheme 333
6.3.2. Seniority Rules in the State Services of West Bengal 334
a. The West Bengal Services (Determination of Seniority) Rules, 1981 334
i. Determination of Seniority of direct recruits 334
ii. Determination of seniority of promotees 335
iii. Relative seniority of direct recruits and promotees 336
iv. Determination of seniority of transferees 336
b. The West Bengal Civil Service (Executive) (Determination of Seniority) Rules, 2008 337
i. Seniority of Members of West Bengal Civil Service (Executive) 337
6.3.3 Promotion and Seniority Policy in Sub-Ordinate and Higher Judiciary in the State of West Bengal 339

a. Judicial Officers other than District Judges 339
i. Seniority 340
b. Higher Judicial Official in the rank of District Judges 341
i. Seniority of Higher Judicial Officers in the Rank of District Judges 341
ii. Inter-se Seniority 341
6.4. Determination of Seniority in Various 'Services' within the State of West Bengal 342
6.4.1. Approach of the Survey 342
6.4.2. Methodology and Sample Size 342
6.4.3. Determination of Seniority for Promotion in Government Departments and Corporations within the Territory of West Bengal 343
6.4.4. Determination of Seniority in Defence Services within the Territory of West Bengal 345
6.4.5. Determination of Seniority among Teachers of Universities, Colleges and Research Institutions within the Territory of West Bengal 347
6.4.6. Determination of Employees of Local Bodies within the Territory of West Bengal 349
6.5. A Comparative Analysis of the Selected 'Services' under the 'State' within the Territory of West Bengal 351
6.5.1. Right to Promotion or Right to be Considered for Promotion 351
6.5.2. Determination of Promotion According to Seniority or Merit 352
6.5.3. Principles of Promotion Where It is Made More than Once 355
6.5.4. Computation of Seniority in the Selected Service Sector 360
6.5.5. Inter-se Seniority 362
6.6. A Sum-Up 363

CHAPTER - 7 : CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS 367-385

Bibliography *386-392*

Annexure