

## Chapter VII

### SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

In the last chapter of the thesis, we arrive at a conclusion. This part includes the summaries of the chapters and then finally a conclusion is attempted. In the first chapter the introduction, we discussed about the research problem, research questions, research methodology, data collection and finally organisation of the study. In the second chapter of the thesis, we have mainly dealt with the origin and growth of the SSP since 1984. In section I we have studied the emergence of Namgyal dynasty and the consequent political developments in Sikkim. After Sikkim became a Protectorate of British India in 1890 it witnessed a number of political and administrative reforms. In 1947, the first organised political party, Sikkim State Congress (SSC) was formed through the merger of Praja Sudharak Samaj, Rajya Praja Sammelon and Praja Mandal in the public meeting held at Pologround, Gangtok.

In January 1973, fifth Sikkim State Council election was held. The SNP secured 11 seats while SJC and SNC secured 2 and 5 seats respectively. L D Kazi of SNC and Krishna Chandra Pradhan of SJC protested against the pro-national party officials who were on duty in the election and accused the Sikkim Darbar personal of rigging the election. The agitation culminated in the complete collapse of law and order situation in Sikkim. The Chogyal of Sikkim requested the Indian Government to take charge of law and order of Sikkim. On 8<sup>th</sup> April 1973 the Indian Government took charge of law and order situation of Sikkim. In section II, we have looked at the emergence of Sikkim Congress (SC) government led Kazi with absolute majority after the first Sikkim Assembly election of April, 1974. During this period, Sikkim became a part of India on 16<sup>th</sup> May 1975, Schedule Tribe and Schedule Tribe Order (Sikkim), 1978 and Representation of the People (Amendment) Ordinance 1979 were implemented. In December 1975, Sikkim Congress led by Kazi merged with the Indian National Congress. On 18<sup>th</sup> August 1979, President Rule was imposed in Sikkim which ended the Kazi rule in Sikkim.

In section III, we have discussed the growth of Sikkim Janata Parishad (SJP) in 1977 and its aims and objectives. The SJP led by Bhandari came to power after the 1979 Assembly poll and in 1983 merged with Congress (I). Thereafter, 13 MLAs departed from Bhandari and submitted Homi J Talyarkhan, Governor of Sikkim enumerating corruption charges against him and expressing their lack of confidence against Bhandari in January 1984. On 11<sup>th</sup> May 1984, Bhandari was dismissed by the Governor of Sikkim and B B Gurung became Sikkim's next Chief Minister. On 25<sup>th</sup> May 1984, President's Rule was imposed in Sikkim following the failure of the constitutional machinery under Gurung's ministry. In section IV, we have analysed the formation of SSP on 24<sup>th</sup> May 1984 and its growth, after the dismissal of Bhandari and the aims and objectives and various political issues raised by SSP, the promises made by SSP in the pre Parliamentary and Assembly polls. Then we have found Bhandari winning the lone Lok Sabha seat in December 1984 Parliamentary election and ultimately won the Assembly election of 1985 securing 30 of 32 Assembly seats of Sikkim.

In the third chapter, we were concerned with the ethnic composition of Sikkim and the policies for the protection of linguistic and religious minorities under the SSP led government. In section I, we have discussed the ethnic complexity of Sikkim. In section II, we have focused on Tsongs (Limboos), one of the indigenous inhabitants of Sikkim to understand their ethno-history and political situation during the Chogyal regime and Kazi led government in Sikkim.

In section III, we have looked at the policy of Bhandari led government towards the protection of rights and interests of the Limboo community during its two consecutive terms. After a thorough analysis, we found that Bhandari had suppressed democratic aspiration of the Limboo community. But although Bhandari ruled Sikkim for two consecutive terms, yet he failed to fulfil the inner aspirations of the Limboos. He neither included the Limboos in the list of Schedule Tribe nor restored the 'Tsong Seats' of Limboos in the Sikkim Assembly. In section IV, we have discussed the policies of Bhandari towards two linguistic and religious

minorities, Bhutia-Lepchas of Sikkim. Here, we have examined whether the rights and interests of the two communities was protected and fulfilled by the SSP led government and arrived to the conclusion that Bhandari failed to fulfil the hopes and aspiration of the Bhutia-Lepchas.

In the fourth chapter, we have dealt with the quality of governance and the issue of social justice in Sikkim under the Bhandari regime. In section I, we have looked at the concept and meaning of 'governance' and 'good governance' and then the basic elements of 'good governance'. Here, we have understood that the word 'good governance' is an anonymous term of 'bad or inefficient governance' used to describe as how public institutions conduct public affairs and manage public resources in order to guarantee the realization of human rights and promote the welfare of the people.

In section II, we focused on the quality of 'governance' during the Bhandari led SSP regime. In this section, we have seen that SSP led government was quite responsible, accountable, effective and efficient in the spheres of rural and infrastructural development as well as poverty alleviation. But we also noticed that during this time political participation of the people was limited to only voting, campaigning and attending meetings. There was suppression of democratic aspirations, freedom of speech and expression of the people through the control of press and interference in the activities of the social organisations. In the II Bhandari regime, we have seen the misuse of power and public fund, mismanagement and mis-governance, corruption, nepotism, favouritism and red-tapeism to a high degree in the state. In section III, we have noted the suppression of democratic institutions, opposition political parties and freedom of press and media under the Bhandari regime. In regime II of Bhandari, we have learnt the continual loss of democratic atmosphere, violation of rule of law and victimisation of all forms of opposition. Even we have noticed that social justice was limited only to the welfare and economic benefits of the women, widows,

disabled, old-aged, destitutes, neglected and physically challenged people, schedule tribe and schedule caste and economically disadvantaged people.

In the fifth chapter of the thesis, we have studied the promises, policies and performance of Bhandari led SSP government towards the Agricultural, Educational, Industrial and Service sectors in the state. In section I, we analysed the agrarian structure and land ownership pattern in Sikkim and various agrarian policies and performance of SSP government towards the agricultural sector. Here, we have noticed the government emphasising more on the production of food-grains by setting up Soil Testing Laboratory, Village Level Work Centres, Farms and Regional Centres and application of High Yielding and Improved Varieties of Seeds, chemical fertilizers and pesticides. Minor and major land irrigation and double and multiple cropping methods were encouraged. As a result we find that there was substantial increase of agricultural production. In 1990-1991, production of food-grain in Sikkim accorded an average annual growth rate of 12.2%. The average annual growth rate of fruits was estimated to be more than 12.68%. In cash and commercial crops like vegetable, spices, production climbed up.

In section II of the chapter we have provided a historical overview of education in Sikkim in the pre and post-merger period and various policies and the performance of the SSP led government towards the educational sector. In the educational sector, we have observed that there was marginal growth and development. There was no great achievement in the educational sector other than making education accessible, universal and free to all. The students were exempted from the payment of fees like examination fee, games fee, laboratory fee etc. Textbooks were freely provided to the students up to class XII. In 1987, free education was extended to the college level. During this period, Sikkim witnessed just growth of schools, enrolment of students and number of teachers in the schools by 1992. In higher education, we have noticed only Sikkim Government Degree College getting multiplied streams like Arts, Commerce and

Science and establishment of Sikkim Law College, Teachers' Training Institute and District Institute of Education and Training (DIET). The literacy rate of Sikkim hardly increased from 34.05% in 1981 to 57% in 1991.

In section III, we analysed the growth and development of industries in Sikkim in the pre-SSP period and then arrived at the policies and performance of the SSP led government towards the industrial sector (1985-1994). Here, we have learned the growth and development of 185 Small Scale Industries in the period from 1985-1994. However, the contribution made by the various manufacturing units to the state's income declined to Rs 3.7 million 1991 from Rs 5.2 million of 1985. In section IV, we looked at the growth and development of the Service sector in Sikkim. Here, we have seen the condition of transport and communication during the Chogyal period in Sikkim and then examined the various policies and performance of the SSP led government towards the service sector. We have found that only vehicular transportation was made possible and accessible to far flung and rural areas after the SSP came to power. The roads and bridges were constructed on the basis of higher population, tourist potential, economic development and social welfare schemes were extended. To extend basic facilities, transport of food-grains, easy removal of patients from villages to different Health Centres, attending District and other offices and to transport the agricultural products to the marketing centres. The Railway Out Agency at Gangtok and Jorethang for passengers travelling to Delhi, Calcutta, Chennai, Trivandrum, Bangalore, Mumbai, Cochin and other connecting routes from Sikkim was also established.

In the sixth chapter, we have analysed the **'Welfare Policies of the SSP led Government in Sikkim'**. In section I, we have looked at the historical context of the growth and development of the concept of 'Welfare' and 'Welfare State' in the developed and the Third World countries, especially India and then in Sikkim in the pre as well as post-merger period. Here, we have learnt that in India, the concept of 'welfare state' arrived in 1947 with the introduction of various programmes and

schemes relating to social welfare, social defence and social insurance. In section II, we have noted the commitments and pledges made by the SSP led government in the Election Manifestoes of 1984 and 1989 in relation to the welfare as well as poverty alleviation policies and programmes. Here, we have learnt about SSP's aim of striving for all-round development of the people of Sikkim by giving topmost priority to the socially, economically and educationally backward communities including Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes as well as youths, women and children. It also promised for the fulfilment of basic needs like health, education, housing and provision of safe drinking water, massive electrification, improvement of rural transport and communication and sanitation. In section III, we have looked at the various policies and performance of the SSP government towards welfare activities and examined whether promises made by the SSP towards health and family welfare, social welfare, welfare of the Schedule Tribe and Schedule Caste, government employees, educated unemployed youths and economically backward classes of Sikkim could have been fulfilled. Here, we have found only health care and family welfare becoming accessible with the establishment of Hospitals, Family Health Centres, Primary Health Centres and Primary Health Sub-Centres and upgrading the old hospitals and increasing beds in the District Hospitals and PHCs. Various programmes relating to health care and control of diseases were launched to fight against killer diseases such as tuberculosis, diphtheria, tetanus, polio, whopping cough and measles.

We have found the grant of pensions to the old-aged people, monthly monetary grant to the disabled persons and scholarships for the disabled for their education under Subsistence Allowance scheme. The Day Care Centres and Recreation Centres, hostels for the working women and destitute homes for the orphans were established. For Schedule Tribe and Schedule Caste School going children, we haven't found any facilities other than pre-matric and post-matric scholarship. For the poor ST families, piglets, bullocks, milch cows and sewing machine and black smithy tools for the SC families and GCI sheets for roofing houses of both ST and SC was distributed. Training on knitting, tailoring, carpet

weaving, cane and bamboo work and blacksmithy was imparted. For educated unemployed youths and economically disadvantaged groups, only training relating to handicrafts, trades and industrial units was imparted. Financial assistance in the form of loans and raw materials were provided at subsidised rate to the educated unemployed youths who were interested in establishing industrial units. For the upliftment of the economically weaker section, economic assistance scheme, social housing and group housing scheme and financial assistance scheme were launched. For the rural farmers, high yielding varieties of seeds, chemical fertilizers, pesticides, manures and implements were distributed at free of cost. The piglets, crossbred cows, poultry birds were provided under Livestock Scheme. For the employees, Pension Rules relating to pensionary benefits, rates of pension and gratuity being revised. Rules for commutation of pension were introduced from 2.9.1985 enabling the pensioners to commute a portion of pension and draw a lump-sum amount. Leave Rules was revised and elaborated provisions for various kinds of leave admissible to Government servants were made. The Earned Leave was raised from 180 days to 240 days. Provision for encashment of leave was also introduced.

In section IV, we have looked at the various poverty alleviation policies and development programmes and schemes implemented by the SSP led Government and examined whether SSP was able to fulfil its promises and make Sikkim a poverty free state. We have found only the construction of school buildings, playgrounds, village roads and jeepable roads, water ponds, anganwadi centres, irrigation channels, community halls, panchayat ghars, bridges, village tanks and Indra Awas Houses and other works relating to sanitation, flood control, soil conservation, land development, nursery, social forestry works and welfare activities. The families belonging to Below Poverty Line were benefited with ginger, cardamom, potato and orange plantation and milch cow, bullock, goattory, piggery, poultry, pisciculture. Similarly, we also noticed the establishment of Rural Agent of marketing centre in Gangtok and Delhi for marketing outlet. Women were provided one time grant of Rs 15,000/-as revolving

fund to run business. A biogas plant which facilitated the generation of gas for cooking and lighting from animals, human waste of biomass was provided to the family having 3-4 cattle. We have found safe drinking water was provided to 369 of 440 villages and electrification of 400 of 405 habitable Revenue Blocks of Sikkim and 3,104 households belonging to BPL were electrified. About 7898 rural sanitary latrines and foot-bridges over those rivers and streams and village roads for inter-village connection and connection of villages with nearest market place, health centres, government establishment and motarable roads. The essential commodities especially food items were made available at subsidised and uniform rate and uniform pricing policy by the government for the control of market monopoly, black marketing and hoarding was made.

Till now in this chapter we made a summary of the entire chapters now let us finally arrive at a conclusion. We have noted earlier that SSP led by Bhandari emerged as the strongest regional political party and dominated state politics of Sikkim from 1984 onwards. During its regime, we have found SSP focusing more on the rural and infrastructural development and poverty alleviation.

In the agricultural sector, upon which most of the populace of Sikkim depend, we noticed only slight improvement in agricultural production. The application of chemical fertilizer, pesticides, manures, adaptation of new techniques and scientific methods of cultivation and utilisation of High Yielding and Improved Varieties of Seeds were only found as the new measures adopted by the SSP led government. From 1985 to 1991, only 61200 to 67340 hectares of land was covered with HYIVS respectively. The consumption of fertilizer had increased just by 68% i.e, from 985 tonnes in 1981 to 1658 tonnes in 1991. The consumption of pesticides, fungicides and other plant protection materials had also increased only by 65% i.e, from 20 tonnes in 1981 to 33 tonnes in 1991. The routine work for seed testing, soil testing and pathological tests was carried out in the laboratories. The programme of planting material propagation, adaptive research, farmers' training, vegetable marketing, demonstration, dry farming,

rejuvenation, soil reclamation and assistance to small and marginal farmers was implemented in the field level. But the measures adopted by the government did not have much impact on agricultural production in Sikkim.

The production of food-grain increased just to 133.44 thousand tonnes in 1990-1991 from 99.99 thousand tonnes of 1980-1981 and food-grain in Sikkim increased at the growth rate of just 12.2%. Similarly, in the oilseeds, fruits and cash crops production, there was no significant increase. The production was estimated only to 5900 tonnes in 1990-1991 against 5700 tonnes in 1985-1986. In fruit, growth rate was marginal. It climbed just from 8200 tonnes in 1985-1986 to 10500 tonnes in 1990-1991. The average annual growth rate of fruits was only 12.68%. In cash and commercial crops, vegetable and spices also increase in production was not much remarkable. The vegetable production increased from 13900 tonnes of 1985-1986 to just 15000 tonnes in 1990-1991. The production of cardamom declined from 3800 tonnes in 1986 to 2600 tonnes in 1995. Only in ginger, there was considerable increase from 10900 tonnes in 1984-1985 to 24000 tonnes in 1994-1995. The agricultural production in Sikkim was even not sufficient for domestic consumption. The essential commodities like food-grains, edible oils, etc had to be imported from outside Sikkim under the Public Distribution System.

In the educational sector too, we have found only primary education becoming accessible to the people during SSP led government regime. No matter there was a sharp increase in schools from 794 of 1985 to 1343 in 1992, enrolment of students from 83337 of 1985 to 113849 in 1992 and number of teachers from 4298 of 1985 to 6546 in 1992. For vocational courses especially for drop-outs and students of class XII was introduced in the government Senior Secondary Schools. The students were exempted from payment of fees like exam fee, games fee, laboratory fee etc. Text books were freely provided to the students up to class XII. But still accessibility and universalisation of education to the children of the remote places could not be attained fully.

In the field of higher education also, we do not notice any remarkable development in the SSP led government. The Degree College established in 1977 by Kazi government was just multiplied into numerous faculties like arts, science and commerce and Sikkim Law College, Teachers' Training Institute and District Institute of Education and Training (DIET) were established. But the dire need of degree colleges in each four districts of Sikkim, establishment of B.Ed Colleges, Medical Colleges, Engineering Colleges and other Professional Colleges and University in the state was not felt as necessary. Had SSP government have realised such need, then much achievement could have been attained in the educational sector and the growth rate of literacy in Sikkim could have been more rapid. The increase of literacy rate from 34.05% in 1981 to 57% in 1991 is also not much remarkable.

In the industrial sector, though the government initiated number of steps, yet we do not see much headway. No matter, after 1985, there was a rapid growth of industries in Sikkim with the establishment of number of small and big scale industrial units. But still the performance of industrial sector in Sikkim was not so well. The contribution made by the various manufacturing sector to the state's income declined from 5.7 million in 1980 to 2.2 million in 1995. So, there was a steep decline of Net State Domestic Product (NSDP) from Rs 5.7 million in 1980 to Rs 2.2 million in 1995 with the margin of Rs 3.5 million within 15 years of gap. The decline in the industrial sector in Sikkim might be due to the topographical location of Sikkim, unavailability of raw materials, lack of skilled manpower and technology. But whatsoever may be the reason but we have found that the performance of industries in Sikkim under the SSP regime was very poor.

In the service sector, although transport and communication was said to have had gained momentum of progress and development during the SSP government's regime, yet we did not notice so much accessibility to the far flung areas especially in the villages. The construction and maintenance of roads and

bridges in the villages of remote places were not paid attention and taken care. Through the interview taken from the local gentries, we came to know that in the remote villages, bamboo, cane and log bridges were constructed over the streams and rivers. The roads were also not constructed and maintained in the most of the villages. In some of the places, transportation was possible only for reaching basic facilities, transport of food-grains, removal of patients from villages to different Health Centres, attending district, other offices and to transport the agricultural products to the marketing centres. The construction and proper maintenance of roads and bridges were confined only to the urban areas and National Highways, state and district roads. We have also noted that during the Bhandari regime, buses managed by Sikkim Nationalised Transport were the means of transport and communication in most of the places in Sikkim. Such development hardly could ease the hardship and inconvenience of the common people.

In the health and welfare sector, we have observed some commendable performance. For the extension of family welfare and basic health care to the doorsteps of the rural masses, we have found only the establishment of some district hospitals, Primary Health Centres and Primary Health Sub-Centres in the villages and upgradation of existing hospitals. There was slight reduction of infant and maternal mortality. For better diagnostic and treatment, modern sophisticated equipments were installed in the Gangtok hospital, but the same was not extended to every district hospitals. The patients with complicated diseases either had to be taken to Gangtok or outside Sikkim. No matter, free medicines and free diet was provided in all the hospitals, Primary Health Centres and Primary Health Sub-Centres but there was a lack of specialised doctors and nurses in the hospitals and Primary Health Centres.

During our study, we have also noticed that centrally initiated programmes, Family Welfare Programme, Family Planning Programme, Tuberculosis Control Programme, National Programme for the Control of

Blindness, National Malaria Eradication Programme and Diarrhoeal Disease Control Programme being implemented in Sikkim to control and fight against tuberculosis, diphtheria, tetanus, polio, whooping cough and measles. Under Family Planning Programme, sterilisation and Intra-Uterine-Devices (IUD) insertions and cataract operation under National Programme for the Control of Blindness was carried out. The detected fever cases were brought under control. For better health status for mothers and children, Mid-day Meal Programme, Supplementary Nutrition Programme and Nutrition Programme were implemented.

For social welfare, we have learned that the extension of Old-Age Pension Scheme only to 1154 old-aged people and grant of monthly monetary benefits and scholarships to the disables for education. For imparting training to the disabled, in cane and bamboo works on daily wages basis to meet their livelihood, we have found the establishment of only Sheltered Workshop at Jorethang and distribution of wheel chairs, crutch axilla, crutch elbow, hearing aid, calliper and spectacle to physically handicaps. The reservation of just 3% in government job for the disables and free travelling facility for them in the Sikkim Nationalised Transport (SNT) buses was provided. Day Care and Recreation Centres and hostels for the working women and tribal students were established. The Destitute Homes were provided grant-in-aids. For the social defence, we have noticed the establishment of Observation Home for temporary reception of juveniles, Juvenile Home and Special Home for the care, protection, education, training of neglected delinquent, competent Authorities like Juvenile Welfare Board, Juvenile Court under Juvenile Justice Act 1986.

For the extension of economic benefit and welfare of the Schedule Tribe and Schedule Castes, we have found only schemes like Scholarship Scheme, Housing Assistance and Economic Grant Scheme, Tools and Implements Scheme launched. We have noticed just 3511 Schedule Tribe and 2735 Scheduled Caste students being benefited under pre-matric and post-matric scholarship schemes

respectively and 433 ST and 150 SC families under Housing Assistance and Economic Grant Scheme. There was also distribution of GCI sheets just to 4132 ST and 592 Sc families for house roofing and piglets, bullocks, milch cows to the ST and SC families and sewing machine and black smithy tools to the SC. Training on knitting, tailoring, carpet weaving, cane and bamboo works and blacksmith under TRYSEM, NREP and RLEGP was imparted to the STs and SCs. For educated unemployed youths and economically disadvantaged groups, training on wiring, knitting, tailoring, carpet weaving, cane and bamboo works, chalk, candle and soap making, sanitary fitting, carpentry, mosaic mansion, marble stone fitting and fixing and iron grill making and mushroom plantation, vegetable cultivation, trades and industrial units was imparted. Financial assistance in the form of loans was also provided for the establishment of industrial units. For the upliftment of the poor section of the society, schemes like economic assistance scheme, social housing and group housing scheme and financial assistance scheme were launched. For the poor and rural farmers, under Seed Multiflication and Distribution Programme, high yielding varieties seeds, chemical fertilizers, pesticides, manures and implements were distributed at free of cost. The piglets, crossbred cows, poultry birds were provided under Livestock Scheme.

For the pensionary benefits of the employees, Pension Rules was revised. Rate of pension and gratuity was revised w.e.f 1.4.1985. Rule for commutation of pension was introduced from 2.9.1985 enabling the pensioners to commute a portion of his/her pension and draw a lump-sum amount. The commute value of pension was restored to the pensioners after 15 years of commutation provided the pensioners were alive at that time. Leave Rule was revised and elaborated and provisions for various kinds of leave admissible to Government servants had been made. The Earned Leave was raised from 180 days to 240 days. Provision for encashment of leave was also made.

In the course of our study, we have also found the implementation of only centrally sponsored schemes like Integrated Rural Development Programme

(IRDP), Training of Rural Youth for Self-Employment (TRYSEM), Development of Women and Children in Rural Area (DWCRA), New and Renewable Energy Sources Cell (NRSE), National Rural Employment Programme (NREP), Rural Landless Employment Guarantee Programme (RLEGP) and Jawahar Rozgar Yojana (JRY) for the rural development and poverty alleviation in Sikkim under the Bhandari regime. We did not notice any state schemes and programmes launched by the state government for rural development.

We have seen that the families belonging to the Below Poverty Line being benefited with only ginger, cardamom, potato, orange plantation, milch cow, bullock, goattory, piggery, poultry, pisciculture and financial assistance for running small business and carpet and handloom weaving and black smithy under IRDP. Under DWCRA, only Rural Agent for marketing centre in Gangtok and Delhi were opened for marketing outlet and grant of Rs 15000/-as revolving fund to run business among the women. Under Biogas Energy Scheme, a biogas plant was provided to the family having 3-4 cattles to facilitate gas generation for cooking and lighting from animals and human waste of biomass. The school buildings, playgrounds, village roads and jeepable roads, water ponds, anganwadi centres, irrigation channels, community halls, panchayat ghars, bridges, village tanks and Indra Awas Houses were constructed and other works relating to sanitation, flood control, soil conservation, land development nursery, social forestry works and welfare activities were carried out under JRY. Safe drinking water was also made possible only to 369 of 440 villages and only 400 of 405 habitable Revenue Blocks of Sikkim were electrified. Under Free Electrification Scheme, 3104 households belonging to BPL were only electrified.

Under MRSP, NWP and CRSP, just 7898 rural sanitary latrines were constructed. The foot-bridges over those rivers and streams and village roads for inter-village connection and connection of villages with nearest market places, health centres, government offices and motarable roads were constructed under Rural Connectivity Scheme. The essential commodities were made available to the

people at subsidised and uniform rate. For the control of market monopoly, black marketing and hoarding uniform pricing policy was adopted. Fair price shops were opened for the proper distribution of essential commodities.

Under the Bhandari regime, we have also noticed the trample of democratic values and social justice in Sikkim. Due to the absence of strong opposition political parties in Sikkim, Bhandari emerged as an undisputed political leader in the state politics of Sikkim after 1985. Such kind of situation led to the absence of check and balance of power and continual loss of democratic atmosphere in the state. Bhandari turned more powerful, authoritative and tyrant and intolerant of any criticism from both outside and within party. Opposition parties and social organizations were not allowed to function independently in ventilating the interests and rights of the people. They either had to join or face serious consequences. There was a continuous interference of SSP in the activities of the social organisations. The rule of Bhandari after 1985 was of worse type. He was more arrogant, tyrant and corrupt. There was a loss of democratic spirit even within the cabinet and party functioning. The elected representatives had to remain faithful and loyal 'yes man' of Bhandari for their existence.

After winning the election of 1989, Bhandari became an autocrat. Lhendup Dorjee Kazi accused the political situation of Sikkim under Bhandari regime being 'worse than during the Chogyal regime'. The people had lost the sense of freedom and they were living in constant fear. There was a suppression of democratic aspiration of the people by a handful of politicians, bureaucrats and businessmen. The freedom of speech and expression were curtailed. There was rampant corruption and victimization of opposition. The press in Sikkim as Bhandari claimed to have been divided into- 'Sangrami press' and 'anti-Sangrami press'. He dubbed those 'anti-Sangrami press' as 'anti-people elements'. The government authorities through various agencies and individuals kept a watchful eye on anyone who was associated with 'anti-government elements'. The press and media had to face threat of life and property. They were asked to behave properly

otherwise have to face consequences. There was assault, threats, constant pressure and ransack over the press and media, arrest and use of commandos over the opposition political parties. Circulating political paper in Bhandari's regime was equal to inviting death. The administration, bureaucracy and the police force were used to torture the public to no end. Bhandari wanted to control all the people by coercion and physical torture. He tried to establish hegemony of one reign, one leader, one party and one language in Sikkim. Bhutia (1999) have accused Bhandari of being more tyrant, secessionist, intolerant, dictator and a corrupt leader.

Since 1990s, in Sikkim we witnessed the loss of democratic values and suppression of people's aspirations. Several leaders of the opposition parties who opposed Bhandari dictatorial regime and voiced against Bhandari's policy and style of functioning were either arrested or detained and physically tortured and harassed. Their houses were raided.

Bhandari is accused of misusing his office position to throttle the voice of the people and Independence of the Judiciary. On the strength of muscle power, money power, deceit and intrigue, the judiciary was rendered impotent, used government machinery to his own advantage and threw the state economy in a state of disarray and confusion. He strangled democracy to trample anti-sangramis. He is also accused of forcefully propagating one religion, one party, one leader and one language hegemony in Sikkim to brutally suppress the existence of other opposition parties. He wanted to control all the people by coercion and physical torture. This is how the spirit of democracy was hijacked and suppressed when one-man-rule and one-man-reign of Bhandari began and representative democracy under his autocratic regime reached the highest stage of maturity in Sikkim.

During his two consecutive terms under SSP led government, Bhandari could champion only the grant of citizenships to 80,000 persons who were said to

have been stateless and inclusion of Nepali language in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Indian Constitution. But Bhandari failed to respond and fulfil aspirations and demands of the people of Sikkim. He was not serious with the issues of linguistic and religious minorities like Limboo and Bhutia-Lepcha and did not feel to protect their rights and interests. He failed to restore 16 lost seats of Bhutia-Lepchas and 02 seats he promised earlier for the Limboos. He was reluctant to include the Limboos in the list of Schedule Tribe despite of their continuous demand. Granting seats reserved for the Nepalis in the Assembly and inclusion of Bhutia, Lepcha and Limboo languages along with the Nepali language in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Indian Constitution remained just like a begging bowl of votes during the elections.

Bhandari did play not only with the sentiments of Bhutia-Lepcha and Limboos of Sikkim but also with the other communities by denying them OBC status. In 1990, communities like Limboo, Manger, Rai, Tamang, Gurung and Bhujel were included in the list of Other Backward Classes (OBC) of Sikkim by the Central Government under Mandal Commission but Bhandari refused to implement the Commission's recommendation in the state on the ground that such recommendation was discriminatory and could divide the ethnic communities. This refusal of accepting the commission recommendations in Sikkim further indicated his denial of social justice to those Backward Classes who were genuine and the deserving sections of the society.

Interestingly, we have also noted that during his earlier political carrier, Bhandari had accused Kazi of being corrupt and swore that he would punish the regime of the Kazi Government for all sorts of corruption, favouritism and nepotism practised if it comes to power. But paradoxically, he was hacked in 1984 and his government was dismissed on the charges of over corruption and possessing disproportionate properties. Such person, who raised voice against corruption, ironically could not remain cleanest against corruption.

The 'Son of the Soil' policy which Bhandari formulated during the elections could not make much headway. Selling of reserved seats for the Sikkimese students to the non-locals, allotment and distribution of sites and trade licences to non-locals, discrimination regarding the grant of scholarships to the students, refusal to allot work for the local contractors on the tender basis, favouritism, red-tapism and nepotism concerning jobs in the government service and back-door leverage for non-locals to share in the state's administrative and economic development plans are some of the activities which contradicted the Bhandari's principle of 'Son of the Soil' policy. 'Sikkim for Sikkimese' slogan adopted by Bhandari and his promise of 'anti-merger' were not fulfilled. Bhandari championed only in betraying the people who supported him during elections. It is alleged that 'Kazi sold only the body but Bhandari sold the soul of Sikkim'. He was neither successful in fulfilling the innermost hopes and aspirations of the people nor maintain cordial relation with the centre. He had double standard politics; projecting himself as a Congressman at the Centre and attacking the Congress unit in the State. This is the reason why Bhandari was accused of being anti-national sometimes.

In the course of our study, we have found that there was a continual loss of democratic values within the cabinet and outside the party after 1990s. Within the ministry, the cabinet ministers and MLAs had to remain either faithful or loyal 'yes man' of Bhandari for their existence. Otherwise they were threatened to resign or leave the party. The style of functioning of the SSP government led by Bhandari was one-man-reign and one-man-rule as such sometimes he acted as a tyrant. The tyrannical style of functioning within the cabinet and autocratic rule of Bhandari gradually led to the growth of inner party conflict and differences between Bhandari and members of Sikkim Legislative Assembly. Outside government, there was a growth of discontentment among the different communities and distrust upon Bhandari. The Bhutia-Lepchas were disappointed. The Denjong Tribal Yargay Chogpa was not happy with the inclusion of Nepali language in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Indian Constitution and expressed their

resentment by alleging Bhandari for working in favour of his own Nepali community. Some section of the people who wanted Sikkim's de-merger were also displeased with Bhandari's failure to do with de-merger of Sikkim. The Limboos were not pleased with Bhandari government for not fulfilling their aged-old demand of seats reservation in the Sikkim Assembly and their inclusion in the list of Schedule Tribe. Akhil Sikkim Kirat Limboo Chumlung was frequently demanding for Bhandari's resignation from his Chief Minister post. The discontentment and dissatisfaction grew even among the other communities like Manger, Rai, Tamang, Gurung and Bhujel after Bhandari's refusal to accept the Mandal Commission recommendations in Sikkim and inclusion of Limboo, Manger, Rai, Tamang, Gurung and Bhujel in the list of Other Backward Classes (OBC).

Meanwhile, there was also a gradual growth of differences between Bhandari and his Cabinet Minister, Pawan Chamling due to the frequent loss of democratic values within the cabinet and the state and autocratic style of functioning within Bhandari led SSP government. On July 1992, Bhandari removed Chamling from the post of Cabinet Minister and later from the primary membership of SSP. There from, Bhim Raj Rai, belonging to Chamling's community was appointed to the cabinet rank in place of Chamling. It is believed that the appointment of Mr Rai in place of Chamling was diplomacy of Bhandari to pacify his anti-OBC image.

After the removal of Chamling from the SSP, he in March 1993 formed Sikkim Democratic Front (SDF). Here it is worth mentioning that in 1989, Chamling had won the Assembly election, with 94.27% of total votes casted in his constituency while Bhandari had only 91.53% from Soreng constituency. This clearly indicated Chamling had more political base than Bhandari. Moreover, Chamling belonged to Rai community which had the highest vote bank in Sikkim and Chamling by virtue of being an OBC naturally had a good chance of becoming a leader to lead Sikkim. During this time in Sikkim, race and language also had

crucial role to play to determine state politics of Sikkim. Chamling racially belonged to the Mongoloid stock and with Rai language belonging to Tibet-Burman linguistic stock while Bhandari belonged to Aryan stock by race with Nepali language belonging to Indio-Aryan linguistic stock. This was another advantage of Chamling of winning the heart of the people in Sikkim and becoming a leader.

In 1993-1994, the Government of India proposed to extend the Central Income Tax Act, 1961 to Sikkim w.e.f, April 1995. Bhandari, in a letter to the central government, on 24<sup>th</sup> July 1993, requested for Tax exemption to the tribal communities in the pretext that the tribal in the North-Eastern states of India are exempted from such taxes. When Bhandari adopted such a taxation policy, the Sikkimese people were further divided into Tribal and Non-tribal in terms of Central Tax payment. The Sikkim People's Forum formed on 18<sup>th</sup> March 1994, called three days strike in protest against Bhandari's taxation policy demanding tax exemption for even Non-tribal people of Sikkim on 22<sup>nd</sup> March 1994. There was agitation, protest and resentment throughout Sikkim. Democracy started fading and anti-Bhandari movement started taking deep root in Sikkim. The political situation in Sikkim started growing tense to more tense.

On 5<sup>th</sup> May 1994, Bhandari's government split into two groups and there from 18 dissident MLAs of Bhandari government defected siding in favour of new leadership under Sanchaman Limboo. In order to prove the strength of Bhandari in the Sikkim Legislative Assembly, no-confidence motion was held on 17<sup>th</sup> May 1994. After an hour long Assembly discussion and abstention of Chamling from voting in the no-confidence motion, Bhandari led government fell. This resulted in the formation of a new government on 18<sup>th</sup> May 1994, under the Chief Ministership of Sancha Man Limboo. But soon the government led by Sancha Man Limboo lost majority following the resignation of two tribal ministers, Thukchuk Lachungpa and O.T Bhutia and remained as care-taker government till Assembly election was held. In November 1994, Assembly election was held in Sikkim. On

the plank of the restoration of democracy in Sikkim SDF fought the Assembly election in 1994. On 12<sup>th</sup> December 1994, SDF led by Chamling came to power putting an end to 10 years old SSP regime of Bhandari.

So far as our study on '*democracy and development*' under the SSP regime led by Bhandari is concerned we therefore find both democracy and development in Sikkim made limited advances during the period. Democracy was confined to voting, campaigning during elections and attending party meetings. So in Sikkim, democracy under the SSP regime was neither fully participatory nor developmental or protective in its kind. Development was also limited only to infrastructure development. Even though democracy was introduced in Sikkim during the regime of SSP led government but it made only limited advances.

Development also took place to a limited extent. The development works which took place in the rural areas of Sikkim were all under the aegis of the schemes sponsored by the Central government. There were construction of rural sanitary latrines, school buildings, playgrounds, village roads, water ponds, ICDS centres, irrigation channels, Community Halls and Panchayat Ghars, bridges, village tanks, Indra Awas Houses, sanitation work, flood protection work, soil conservation work, land development nursery work, social forestry work and works relating to welfare of the rural people. But all these developmental works were carried out by the state government under various schemes sponsored by the Central government.

In between 1985-1994, 400 of 405 habitable Revenue Blocks were electrified in Sikkim with the financial assistance of Rural Electrification Corporation. Still 05 Revenue Blocks remained in the grip of darkness. Under Free Electrification Programme, only 3104 households belonging to the BPL families were electrified but 3100 households remained without electricity connection. Therefore, the SSP government could not achieve 100% village electrification in the state. Safe drinking water could be provided only to 369 of 400 villages of

Sikkim. More than 71 villages remained uncovered. The policy home for homeless was only a dream for Bhandari. By 1992, only 4132 families belonging to ST and 592 SC families were provided CCI sheets for roofing their houses. In between 1987-1988, only 12999 families belonging to the BPL were covered. Under Housing Assistance Scheme and Economic Assistance too, only 378 families belonging to the BPL and 41279 belonging to the ST and SC families were benefited. Under Indra Awas Yojana, 658 houses for those belonging to Below Poverty Line were constructed in between 1985-1992. There were still more people living without proper houses in the state.

Under Improved Chulla Scheme 4130 families benefited. Community size chullas were also constructed in school Hostels, Hospitals, Temples and Monastery kitchens. Numerous training was conducted to create cadre of trained self-employed workers in solving unemployment problems. Under the Biogas Energy Scheme, a biogas plant which provided facilities to generate gas for cooking and lighting from animals, human waste of biomass without reducing and damaging the manure value was introduced. Any family having 3-4 cattle were provided 2 Cu. m capacity gas plant to meet up cooking requirement of 4-5 family members. Under this scheme 272 families were benefited by 1992. Similarly, under Solar Energy Scheme, 70 solar street lights and domestic lights in Panchayat Ghars, Bhawans, Hostels, Schools, Temples and Monasteries were installed. From 1985-1992, the state had over 40 solar water heaters in the institutions, hospitals etc.

We also notice that there was an absence of empowerment of women. In the Panchayati Raj Institutions and Assembly, there were no seats reserved for the women. Even in the government services, no provision was made for reserving seats for the women. Constitutionally there was seat reservation in the Assembly for the Schedule Tribes and Schedule Castes but in the Panchayati Raj Institution, there was no seats reserved for them. During the regime of Bhandari, the rate of poverty of Sikkim increased to 41.43% in 1994 against 39.71% of 1984.

Literacy rate climbed just from 34.05% of 1981 to 56.94% in 1991. The contribution of manufacturing sector to the Net State Domestic Product (NSDP) declined from Rs 5.2 million in 1985-1986 to Rs 3.7 million in 1990-1991 and Rs 2.2 million in 1995-1996. Similarly, in the service sector there was no remarkable achievement of the SSP government as such. The construction of roads increased from 1292 kilometres of 1980 to 2243 kilometres by 1992. Hence it can be stated that the progress of democracy and development took place only to a limited extent. The progress of development however was slightly better than democracy.